

NEWS & NOTES

Conference on Hinayānist Sanskrit Literature

The third conference sponsored by the Kommission für buddhistische Studien der Akademie der Wissenschaften was held in Göttingen between 13th-16th July 1982. The occasion was also made to coincide with the 85th birthday of Emeritus Prof. Ernst Waldschmidt, the doyen of researchers in Central Asian literature.

An indication of the scope of the proceedings is provided by the titles of those papers (all of which will be published in 1983) which are likely to prove of most interest to our readers: S.Dietz "Zur Frage der Schulzugehörigkeit der Fragmente des Abhidharmaskandhapādasāstra und der Lokaprajñapti", E.Mayeda "Schools of the Chinese Four Āgamas. Studies in Japan", Bhikkhu Pāsādika "Bericht über die Sammlung von Kanon-Zitaten aus dem Abhidharmakośa", M.Schmidt "Stand der Arbeiten am Sanskrit-Wörterbuch der Turfan-Funde", L.Schmitzhausen "Verschiedene Versionen einzelner kanonischer Lehrreden und das Problem ihrer Schulzugehörigkeit", D.Seyfort Ruegg "Über die Nikāyas der Śrāvakas und den Ursprung der philosophischen Schulen des Buddhismus" and Ch.Tripaṭhi "Saṅgītisūtra, Nipāta II und Ekottarāgama-Parallelen hierzu".

IABS

The fifth conference of The International Association of Buddhist Studies was held at Hertford College, Oxford, between 16th-21st August 1982, under the presidency of Ven.Dr Walpola Rāhula. It had been organised by the local Secretary (and Hon.Secretary of the Pali Text Society), Prof.Richard Gombrich.

All aspects of Buddhology were covered, including special sessions on Buddhist Logic and Epistemology, Art and Iconography, Anthropology of Buddhism, Tibetan Religious and Philosophical Thought, and Contemporary Japanese Buddhism. Reports were received on the Critical Pāli Dictionary, Pāli Tipitakam Concordance, Pāli-English Dictionary (proposed revised edition) and the Journal of the PTS (proposed revival)(by the Editor-in-Chief of the CPD and President of the PTS, K.R.Norman), Hōbōgirin (French-language encyclopaedia of Buddhism based in Kyoto - Hubert Durt), "Sanskrit Dictionary of Buddhist Texts from the Turfan Finds" (Siglinde Dietz), Systematic Survey of Buddhist Sanskrit Literature (Akira Yuyama - who presented the same report in German in Göttingen), and "Group for Buddhist and Jain Philological Studies" in France (Gérard Fussman).

The papers included Thich Thiệu Châu "The Literature of Puṅgalavāda", S.Collins "Friendship as a Buddhist Virtue", L.S.Cousins "Samatha-yāna and Vipassanā-yāna", S.Dietz "Some Problems concerning two Abhidharma Fragments from Gilgit", Mirko Fryba "Applications of Dhamma in Western Therapy", B.G.Gokhale

"Early Buddhism and the Urban Revolution", Paul Griffiths "Nirodhasamapatti: History of a Buddhist Problem", Jacques Maquet "An Aesthetic Anthropological Approach to Buddhism in Sri Lanka", Hisashi Matsumura "Textual Studies of the Gilgit Buddhist Manuscripts", Bhikkhu Pāsādika "Prolegomen on an English Translation of the Sūtrasamuccaya", Joseph F. Roccasalvo "The Anattā Doctrine and Thai Buddhist Interpretations", A. Syrkin "Notes on Buddha's Threats in Dīghanikāya", R.C. Tewari "Socio-Cultural Aspects of Theravāda Buddhism in Nepal" and Martin G. Wiltshire "The Arhat and the Suicide Dilemma: A Problem in Early Buddhism".

Catalogues of Buddhist MSS

Assessing the literary holdings of archives and libraries is a necessary prerequisite to revealing their contents by means of text editions and translations. Thus, the first issue in the series, "Catalogue of Oriental manuscripts, xylographs, etc. in Danish collections" is a welcome addition to this literature. The late C.E. Godakumbura (see PBR II 63) has produced a Catalogue of Ceylonese Manuscripts (1980) which not only updates previous descriptive lists of Pali, Sanskrit and Sinhala texts in the possession of the publishers, the Royal Danish Library, Copenhagen, but incorporates the manuscripts in private hands. (For details of the Rask Collection, the nucleus of the Library's collection of Pali texts, and the work of editors and lexicographers in Denmark, see Russell Webb "Pali Buddhist Studies in Denmark", PBR II 162.) The above volume complements similar works from the same source, viz. G. Coedes Catalogue des manuscrits en pâli, laotien et siamois provenant de la Thaïlande (1966) - much of which was translated for H. Saddhātissa's paper, "Pali Literature from Laos" (Studies in Pali and Buddhism, ed. A.K. Narain, Delhi 1979) - and W. Heissig and C. Bawden Catalogue of Mongol Books, Manuscripts and Xylographs (1971).

In London, as far back as 1876 E. Haas compiled a Catalogue of Sanskrit and Pali Books in the British Museum. Cecil Bendall later prepared a Catalogue of Sanskrit, Pali and Prakrit Books in the British Museum (1893), followed by L.D. Barnett's 2nd and 3rd Supplements (1908 and 1928) which are still available. JPTS II (1883, repr. 1978) featured a "List of Pali MSS in the British Museum" (and similar lists for Cambridge, Copenhagen and Stockholm) by K.J.R. Hoerning who supplemented it in Vol. VII (1888). Unpublished supplements were subsequently drafted by him (1903) and Barnett (1930). Related to these materials is the Nevill Collection of Sinhalese Manuscripts from which the long-awaited Catalogue of Pali-Sinhalese Buddhist Texts, compiled by K.D. Somadasa, is expected to be published in autumn 1983. However, several lists have already appeared, viz. M.de Z. Wickremasinghe Catalogue of the Sinhalese manuscripts in the British Museum (1900), Somadasa Laṅkāve puskola pot-nāmaṅgaḷi (3 vols, Colombo 1959-64),

J. Hettiaracchi List of Sinhalese and Pali manuscripts in the British Library (1974 - typescript translation of Somadasa Vol. 3), Barnett List of Pali, Sinhalese, Sanskrit and other manuscripts, formerly in the possession of Hugh Nevill, Esq. (MS 1909) and Handlist of Sinhalese manuscripts (MS 1908) and M.de Z. Wickremasinghe Catalogue of the Sinhalese printed books in the Library of the British Museum (1901).

For the materials in the other languages of Buddhist South-East Asia see Pe Maung Tin "Burma manuscripts in the British Museum" (Journal of the Burma Research Society 14, Rangoon 1924), L.D. Barnett List of Pali manuscripts, excluding the Nevill collection (typescript, 1930) and Catalogue of the Burmese books in the British Museum (1913), P.H. Herbert "The Sir Arthur Phayre collection of Burmese manuscripts" (British Library Journal I, 1975), G.E. Harrison Handlist of the Tai and Mon-Khmer manuscripts in the British Museum,... (typescript, 1968) and, in preparation by Herbert, Harrison and H. Ginsburg, "Catalogue of mainland South East Asia manuscripts in the British Library".

At the India Office Library, D.J. Wijayaratne and A.S. Kulasuriya have compiled a Catalogue of the Sinhalese Manuscripts (ed. C.H.B. Reynolds, 1981) which complements H. Oldenberg "Catalogue of Pali Manuscripts" (JPTS I, 1882, repr. 1978), V. Fausbøll Catalogue of the Mandalay Manuscripts (off-printed from JPTS XI, 1894-96, repr. 1978), Kenneth Whitbread Catalogue of Burmese Printed Books (1969), L. de La Vallée Poussin Catalogue of the Tibetan Manuscripts from Tun-huang (1962) and P. Denwood Catalogue of Tibetan Manuscripts and Blockprints outside the Stein Collection (1975).

The Buddha's Path to Deliverance

The 4th edition of this classic anthology of Pali texts in translation has just been published by the Buddhist Publication Society, Kandy. The compiler was the late German mahāthera, Nyānatiloka, who is remembered also for his other, world-acclaimed anthology (based on the Four Noble Truths), The Word of the Buddha.

The present work, "described as a compendium of the entire teaching of the Buddha", is divided into the three sections of the Noble Eightfold Path - Morality (sīla), Concentration (saṃādhi) and Wisdom (pañña). Suttas (or extracts therefrom) are arranged in this order to present an authoritative and indispensable guide to the practice of Buddhism.

Rune E.A. Johansson

Only as a result of unrelated correspondence has the Editor learned of the death of Dr Johansson at his home in Spånga, Sweden, sometime during the summer of 1981. (His widow declined to reply to the Editor's request for further details but it is known that her husband was obliged to retire from Lund University for health reasons some years ago.)

Born 1918, he studied Psychology, Sanskrit and Pali at Lund and obtained his licentiate in 1954. He continued his studies in Sanskrit at the University of Calcutta and in Pali at the University of Ceylon where he prepared a long paper on "Citta, Mano, Viññāna - a Psychosemantic Investigation" (University of Ceylon Review XXIII, 1965). His English study, The Psychology of Nirvāṇa (London 1969), was the first attempt to fit all the different explanations of Nirvāṇa contained in the Pali Canon into a consistent picture, relating the whole to Western psychology. A sequel to this work, based upon the formula of paticca-samuppāda, was published in 1978 by the Scandinavian Institute of Asian Studies in Copenhagen under the title, The Dynamic Psychology of Early Buddhism. The first Pali grammar in Swedish was composed by him. Entitled, Buddhistiska Texter Pali, it appeared in the Arsbok 1967-68 which was published in 1969 by the "Seminär for Slavic Languages" at Lund University. An expanded version in English - Pali Buddhist Texts explained to the beginner - was subsequently published by the Scandinavian Institute (Copenhagen 1973). Apart from this primer and a short essay on "Psychological Causality in Early Buddhism" (PBR III 22), Johansson's most notable achievements were the translations of the Dhammapada (the first directly from the Pali - Stockholm 1967) and the Sutta-Nipāta (Buddhistiska ballader och lärodirer, Stockholm 1976). For some inexplicable reason the publisher omitted six suttas (Parābhava, Vasala, Vaṅṅisa, Brāhmanadhammika, Māgha and Kokāliya) from the latter collection and these subsequently appeared in Buddhistisk Gemenskap, the journal of an association with the same name, during 1978-9.

The Dynamic Psychology of Early Buddhism (scheduled for reprint in 1983), Pali Buddhist Texts (revised and enlarged ed. 1981) and the Sutta-Nipāta translation were reviewed for this journal (IV 92; I 123 and II 168; and II 67 respectively). The author provided much of the background material to the Editor's survey on "Pali Buddhist Studies in Sweden" (PBR IV 28).

His is undoubtedly a serious loss to Pali Buddhist research in Scandinavia. May he be at peace.

A Treasury of the Buddha's Words: Discourses from the Middle Collection.

Translated by Nānamoli Thera, edited and arranged by Phra Khantipālo.

3 vols, Mahāmakut, Bangkok, but available only from Wat Buddha-Dhamma, Ten Mile Hollow, Wisemans Ferry, NSW 2255, Australia.

The late Ven. Nānamoli, in his short career, produced an extraordinary number of translations from the Pali in addition to his masterly version of the Visuddhi-magga. Among other things he left a manuscript rendering of the Majjhima Nikāya, a substantial part of which (90 out of the 152 suttas) is here made available. Since it is well-known that the PTS translations of the Canon (even to some extent the Horner Middle Length Sayings) are in need of revision, this is to be welcomed. Nānamoli was a skilled and dedicated worker in this field, who constantly strove after elucidation of the texts and experimented with different renderings in his search for the not juste. While not all his ideas may have been right, they are usually worthy of serious consideration. Another well-known English bhikkhu, Ven. Khantipālo, has made the selection, organising the chosen suttas according to a scheme of his own without regard to their canonical order. Thus the contents of Vol. I, entitled Buddhists, embrace (a) "Lay People" and (b) "Bhikkhu Life"; Vol. II, Doing or Talking?, comprises (a) "Mind, Meditation and Training" and (b) "Dialogue and Views", while Vol. III consists of Part III, Path and Fruit: (a) "Understanding (Wisdom, Insight)" and (b) "Attainment", and Part IV, The Buddha: (a) "Striving and Enlightenment" and (b) "The Tathāgata". The scheme is carefully thought out, and the selection and arrangement provide a coherent and progressive course of study which may recommend itself to the lay reader. There is a 25-page introduction to the whole, and there are individual introductions to the suttas, all but two of them by the editor. On the whole it may be said that an excellent job has been done by both translator and editor, so that one's reservations remain limited to a few points.

The problem of style in translating from Pali is a difficult one even when the meaning of the words is not in dispute. I pick, almost at random, a small passage from Sutta 89 to illustrate how Miss Horner and Nānamoli respectively tackled the task:

(Horner) Then King Pasenadi addressed Dīgha Kārāyana, saying: "Good Kārāyana,

harness some lovely vehicles; we are going to the garden of the pleasure to see its beauties". "Yes, sire", and Dīgha Kārāyana, having answered King Pasenadi in assent, having had many lovely vehicles harnessed, announced to King Pasenadi: "Many lovely vehicles are harnessed for you, sire. You may deem it is now the right time for that."

(Nānamoli) Then he [King Pasenadi] told Dīgha Kārāyana: "My friend, have the state carriages got ready. Let us go to the Pleasure Garden to see a

pleasing spot." "Yes, sire", he replied. When the state carriages were ready, he informed the king: "Sire, the state carriages are ready for you. Now it is time to do as you think fit."

Readers may judge for themselves which version they prefer. It is obvious that the prolixity of the original must be cut in any translation: even Miss Horner has done this a little (though one might not think so); and Nānamoli's version too could be still further cut without loss. At this point I must declare an interest, in both senses of the word. Being engaged on a new translation of the Dīgha Nikāya, I am naturally directly concerned with the problem and have already learnt much from a close study of Nānamoli's way of tackling it. The quoted passage contains nothing remotely "controversial", as some passages inevitably do. Sometimes Nānamoli allowed his enthusiasm for "experimental" renderings to run away with him, and the introduction lists a number of cases where more conventional translations have been substituted for terms introduced by him. His use of "divines" for "Brahmins", which seems to me to be a not altogether happy conceit, has however been retained. Arguably, though, his "thinking and pondering" for vitakka-vicāra is preferable to the substituted "initial and sustained application". However, I will not go further into such matters here. In sum, it seems to me that in the difficult search for a suitable style of translation, Nānamoli made significant advances without, perhaps, always attaining the ideal version.

Ven.Khantipālo's introduction is excellent and covers a lot of ground. Here, I will merely draw attention to his remarks (p.xvii) on the classification of suttas according as the doctrine is stated in terms of dhammas or in terms of persons. His comments on the purely intellectual understanding some people have of the suttas (or of Abhidhamma), and of its limitations, are judicious. He also expresses his opinions, forthrightly but fairly, on one or two other matters. And in general, his introductions to the individual suttas are equally valuable. However, I confess I found his remarks on the Gopaka Moggallāna Sutta (No.108: Vol.I, p.223) a trifle disturbing, the more especially as coming from the author of an excellent book on tolerance! His statement that "in Mahāyāna the Buddha becomes an eternal God" is, as regards most Mahāyāna schools at least, incorrect, while his remark on the same page that "'patriarchates' wherever found in Buddhism are bogus" is needlessly tactless.

Finally, I would offer one suggested solution to a small problem and a few technical criticisms. The note on p.96 of Vol.II mentions an "untraceable word in the original Ms: 'meteorative'? or 'metiorative', 'metioratic'??". I suggest that the word is probably 'meliorative', which makes fair sense. The book is well printed and produced and attractive in form, but something seems

to have gone wrong with the chapter-headings of the suttas which should have been checked. I will merely instance the Dhammādyāda Sutta (Vol.I, p.246), which is given the meaningless name of Dhammayada Sutta. There is also a discrepancy between the title on the cover, A Treasury of the Buddha's Words..., and that on the title-page, A Treasury of the Buddha's Discourses..., which will be the despair of all cataloguers. Also, the only clue as to the book's date is that given at the end of the introduction: 1977. If it really was published as long ago as all that, it must have been an unconscionable time in coming to the notice of the outside world - which is a great pity!

Maurice Walshe

New translations of the Dhammapada:

Phra Khantipālo (tr.) The Path of Truth. Mahāmakut Rājavidyalaya Press, Bangkok 1977. xii + 237pp.

Harischandra Kaviratna (ed. and tr.) Wisdom of the Buddha. Theosophical University Press, Pasadena 1980. xxxiv + 177pp. Cloth \$8.50, paper \$5.00.

Sathienpong Wannapok (ed. and tr.) The Buddha's Words. Distributed by Suksit Siam, Bangkok 1979. xxix + 494pp. \$3.00.

With already over thirty English translations of this ever popular anthology, it seems surprising that yet more budding Pali scholars should attempt further renditions, especially in view of the fact that quite a number of Pali texts remain either untranslated or in urgent need of retranslation.

However, the translators of the first two versions under review justify producing "new" recensions even if, after a succession of textual permutations spanning a century, the arguments employed no longer sound convincing. (Since the third version is wholly in Thai with the exception of the actual stanzas I cannot ascertain the translator's reasons for producing it, other than incorporating the Pali text in Thai script and a Thai translation.) Thus, Ven.Khantipālo states: "English translations of the Dhammapada,...., are mostly in prose. This means that although they may be accurate, beauty and ease of memorizing have been sacrificed. The few attempts at a metrical rendering... have resulted in another extreme - the loss of accuracy through attention given to poetic frills and even to rhyme. Pali verses do not employ rhyme and distortion of meaning is inevitable if a translator tries to press the Buddha's words into it. // An English translation must, of course, lose some of the subtle meanings, particularly in the case of words derived from a single root in Pali, where there are no similar forms in English. The present translation is the result of quite a long effort to present the Buddha's words in a way that is both memorable and accurate - as far as this can be achieved. For this reason, verse form was chosen and the work was also based on an earlier attempt (Growing the

Bodhi Tree, Buddhist Association of Thailand, Bangkok 1966) " (p.47). Dr Kaviratna, the Sinhalese Director of the Oriental Institute, Batapola, states: "Some commentators have curious and artificial renderings, which are not akin to the streams of Buddhist and Vedic thought prevalent in India during the time of the Buddha. Most of the European and Indian translators have based their renditions upon these artificial commentaries without any deep penetration into the philosophic currents of that early period. // For this...volume, I have diligently compared the best European translations...with Sanskrit, Burmese and Chinese versions. Special care has been taken to bring out a faithful word-for-word rendition that is lucid, free of bias and, as far as possible, true to the wisdom and pristine grace of the original Pāli texts" (p.xxviii).

Ven. Khantipālo has prefaced his version with two essays on "The Buddha's Teaching from the Dhammapada" and "Everyday Buddhism" which both introduce the text within the context of the Buddhaddhamma and "comment on Dhammapada verses which apply to common events in everyday life". They are framed within the conventional style of traditional Theravādin Dhammaḍḍesaṇā, illuminating a timeless teaching but need not, of course, necessarily be read prior to beginning the text. Each vagga ends with its own notes which are kept to a minimum but are indispensable in many cases, particularly where variant readings suggest themselves. Kaviratna avoids inserting notes (except where absolutely necessary) but but includes the romanised Pali text on each page facing the translation and endeavours to expand the text to overcome possible ambiguity, thus v.370:

"(Of the fetters) cut off the five, renounce the five, and (of the virtues) cultivate the five. He who has gone beyond the five attachments is called a bhikkhu who has crossed the stream."

Whereas Khantipālo puts it thus: "Five cut off and five forsake,
a further five should be developed;
a bhikkhu from five fetters free
is called 'A-forder-of-the-flood'"

- but explains the formulas in a footnote.

The admirable attempt of the latter to reproduce the didactic sayings of the Buddha in verse and as accurately as possible does unfortunately result in occasional staccato effects; thus, vv.21-22:

"Heedfulness - the path to the Deathless,
heedlessness - the path to death;
the heedful ones do not die,
the heedless are likened to the dead.
The wise, then, recognizing this
as the distinction of heedfulness,

in heedfulness rejoice, delighting
in the realm of Ariyas."

Kaviratna's equivalent renderings in prose, however, tend to flow in a more relaxed manner (but no doubt the temptation to elaborate beyond the strict confines of the original text is always present), thus:

"Vigilance is the path to immortality; non-vigilance is the path to death; the vigilant do not die; the non-vigilant, though alive, are like unto the dead.

Knowing this outstanding feature of vigilance, the wise delight in vigilance, rejoicing in the ways of the Noble Ones (ariya)."

But the latter mode is surely preferable when what is at stake is comprehension and lucidity, thus Kaviratna renders v.16:

"The doer of wholesome deeds rejoices here and rejoices hereafter; thus he rejoices in both places. Having beheld his pure deeds he rejoices exceedingly".

Khantipālo, on the contrary, tries to scan the verse by inexplicably using a noun as a verb:

"Here he joys, he joys hereafter;
in both wise does the merit-maker joy;
he joys, then does he rejoice,
his own pure karmas seeing."

The term "delights" may not be strong enough to convey the sense of the original term but what is wrong with the tried and tested term "rejoices"?

It would be physically impossible to make comparisons of this nature throughout the two main translations under review. A choice of stanzas must necessarily be subjective, but, whereas there are many fine metrical renderings in Khantipālo's version which aptly crystallise the Buddha's teaching of direct appeal to heart and mind, it has nevertheless to be admitted that the general rule of losing an intangible quality by means of secondary verse translations holds good. For that reason, no doubt, most translators adopt the safer and less arduous method of prose translation. (Sathienpong's translation, despite an impressive Foreword by Prof. S. Tambiah, has been ignored here because of its similarity with Nārada's classic rendering which, in the minds of many, including that of the late I. B. Horner, constitutes the most authoritative recension.)

Kaviratna has included a list of the rarest Dhammapada manuscripts and their provenance in Sri Lanka together with a Pali-Sanskrit-English glossary of key terms related to the relevant verses. Khantipālo has provided appropriate line drawings to illustrate the main themes in each vagga, an index of first lines in English and, most useful of all, a "Thematic Index" of subjects descri-

bed by the verses, which will prove beneficial to the Dhamma student.

In the ultimate analysis, of course, it is the reader who must decide which version - metrical or prose - will hold more appeal to his intellect, understanding and temperament.

REV

Synonymic Collocations in the Tipitaka: a study. M.G.Dhadphale. Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Poona 1980. xiii + 267pp. Rs 50

Anyone who has consulted the Pada-bhāṣaṇīya which is embedded in the Vinaya-piṭaka, or the Niddesa, or any Pali commentary, cannot have failed to notice the way in which those who wrote in Pali had a predilection for explaining the meaning of a word by means of another word which was a synonym or near-synonym. Both the Petakopadesa and the Netti-ppakaraṇa have sections dealing with the mode of conveying synonyms (Vevacana-hāra) in the guidance they give to commentators, and synonymy is also discussed by the Pali grammarians. Even in non-exegetical texts in the Pali Tipitaka collocations of synonyms or near-synonyms occur, and it is evident that the use of synonyms is a stylistic feature of the language. It is not, however, restricted to the Buddhist Pali scriptures, but is also found in Sanskrit as early as the R̥gveda and in the Jain canon. It is clearly a characteristic of Indian literature as a whole, but synonymy was not employed in Pali solely for stylistic purposes, to add grace to the diction, or to embellish the mode of discourse. The juxtaposition of synonyms can also be regarded as an attempt to define the meaning of a word more accurately by offering a series of approximations, each of which limits the sense more narrowly. In some cases, however, the use of synonyms seems to be dialectal, whereby lexical variants are uttered to enable speakers of various dialects to understand what is being said.

Despite its importance, no full-length analysis of synonymy in Pali has hitherto been made. A dissertation on the subject by Dr M.G.Dhadphale, now published in book form, is therefore greatly to be welcomed. He begins by stating the nature of the problem of synonymy, and then considers definitions and theories which have been put forward by various scholars, both modern Western and ancient Indian. He then surveys different categories of synonyms. Since an explanation or definition of a word has the same meaning as the word being explained or defined, then by an extension of the meaning of the word "synonym" it is possible to regard these explanations and definitions as synonyms. Where the explanation is a metaphor, e.g. the designation of craving (tanhā) as "companion" (duṭṭiya), because craving accompanies us wherever we go, then the metaphor can be regarded as a synonym, i.e. duṭṭiya is a synonym (adhivacana) of tanhā. Dhadphale lists some 200 of such adhivacanas. By a further extension of the concept of synonymy, the word is used of the novel presentations (nibbācanas)

which the Buddha sometimes made up when explaining words by means of a non-historical etymology or etiology, e.g. the explanation of brāhmaṇa as bāhita-pāpa "one who has expelled his evil". This type of equivalence is more appropriately called "folk-etymology" and is found in other languages besides Pali, e.g. asparagus ("sparrow-grass") is "grass for sparrows". Folk etymology is a very important subject in its own right and merits an independent monograph, but meanwhile it is helpful to have Dhadphale's list of some of the more important examples found in the Tipitaka. A further extension of the usage of the term "synonymy" takes us beyond the point where the English definition of the word is appropriate, for in his treatment of synonyms Dhadphale includes the 100 epithets of the Buddha found in Upāli's verses in the Majjhima-nikāya, although it does not really seem possible to regard a word such as nara "man" as a synonym for Bhagavat.

Much of this book is theoretical and analytical in nature, and to that extent it is perhaps too academic for ordinary students of Pali. The needs of such are, however, partly catered for by providing a number of examples of the way in which synonyms enable a reader to decide upon the meaning of a Pali word which by itself is ambiguous or even unintelligible. There are particularly striking examples in the case of synonymous cognates, when a word is explained by a derivation from the same root but with a different affix, e.g. sandeha usually means "doubt" in Sanskrit, but the meaning "body" is assured for some contexts in Pali by the occurrence of deha "body" as a synonym.

Although, as noted above, the author has gone further in some directions than the usual definition of "synonymy" would seem to allow, the limitation of his enquiry to the Tipitaka means that the use of the phenomenon in non-canonical and commentarial texts still awaits investigation. One can do no better than to quote the pair of synonyms with which Dr Dhadphale himself concludes his book: bahukiccā mayam bahukaraṇīyā "we have much to do, we have much to perform".

K.R.Norman

Saṅgharakkhita's Vuttodaya: a study of Pāli metre. Pali text and translated into

English by R.Siddhartha. Preface by Professor J.W.de Jong. Sri Satguru Publications, India 1981. Distributed by Indian Books Centre, Delhi. v + 54pp. Rs.50

Although the Vuttodaya is the only extant Pali text dealing with metrics and prosody, it has attracted but little interest from English-speaking scholars since G.E.Fryer published an edition and English translation of it, with extensive notes, in the Journal of the Asiatic Society of Bengal in 1877. In 1929 R. Siddhartha produced another edition and English translation in the Journal of

the Department of Letters, University of Calcutta, but this seems to have escaped the notice of most scholars; it is, for example, not mentioned in the Epilegomena to the Critical Pāli Dictionary.

The publication under review is a photo-mechanical reprint of the 1929 article. Certain misprinted or, rather, unprinted scansion marks have been left uncorrected, while their number has been increased by defects in the photographic process. Although the page headings give the author's name as Siddhartha, the new title page calls him Siddharatha. The original article lacked an introduction, and there is consequently no information available about the way in which the edition was made, although there are references in footnotes to the readings of "some editions". Nor are we told which commentaries were employed when making the translation, although two references to the *ṭīkā* suggests that the editor had this available to him.

The Vuttodaya was written by Saṅgharakkhita in Ceylon during the reign of Parākrāmabāhu (A.D. 1153-86). It is based upon Kedarabhāṭṭa's (Sanskrit) Vṛttaratnākara, as Professor de Jong states in the newly added Preface which gives a brief, but very valuable, bibliographical survey of Vuttodaya studies. In 136 stanzas, or portions of stanzas, including an introduction in four stanzas, and a conclusion in three (which Siddhartha omits), Saṅgharakkhita describes a large number of Pāli metres, each description being, in fact, a *pāda* of the relevant metre. He does not, however, describe all Pāli metres. He omits the archaic form of the Āryā metre found in a few of the very oldest texts in the Pāli Canon, and does not mention the Upaṭṭhitappacupita metre found in the Lakkhana-sutta of the Dīgha-nikāya. A possible explanation for this is that when Saṅgharakkhita states that he will describe the *lokiya* metres, he is imitating the Sanskrit usage of *laukika*, which is opposed to *vaidika*, i.e. popular (post-Vedic) as opposed to Vedic prosody. He therefore means non-canonical Pāli metres and is consequently justified in omitting mention of metres found only in the Canon.

Siddhartha's work has certain defects. Since the Vuttodaya states that the mark of the long syllable is curved, and that of the short syllable straight, Siddhartha adopts this system throughout his translation, e.g. he shows the dactyl as *u - -*, instead of *- u u*, which is the normal European form, and the unwary reader is likely to be misled. There are also errors in his translation. He translates *sama* as "metres which are regular" and *addhasama* as "metres that are partly regular", whereas Fryer is more accurate with "metres the quarters of which are similar" and "metres the half lines of which are similar", for *addhasama* refers to metres such as Vaitāliya in which the first and third, and second and fourth, *pādas* are similar.

Since Fryer gives a critical apparatus for his edition, states the

commentaries which he has consulted and quotes from them, gives more detailed comments upon his translation, and offers several examples of each metre described, it is perhaps to be regretted that the publishers chose to reprint Siddhartha's work rather than Fryer's. Nevertheless, this reprint is to be welcomed as being likely to draw attention to a somewhat neglected text.

K.R.Norman

Editor. A work related in theme to the foregoing two is *Topics in Pāli Historical Phonology*, published by Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi 1979, at Rs 60.

Its author, Indira Y. Junghare, is Associate Professor in the Department of South Asian Studies, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, and teaches Indo-Aryan Linguistics, Sanskrit, Hindi, Marathi and Indian Philosophy. Her book "is an account of the phonological development of the Pāli language from Sanskrit times, which incorporates the latest developments in linguistic scholarship. Within the framework of generative phonology, it deals with a number of interesting aspects concerning sound changes. It examines the underlying forms, the bases for their postulation, readjustment rules, phonological rules, their order with respect to each other and with respect to the rules in [the] other set. The study separates synchronic rules from historical processes, inherited rules from innovated rules, and generalized rules from particularized rules. Furthermore, it discusses restructuring and global constraint, and suggests some phonological universals on the basis of Pāli assimilatory processes."

This highly specialised study was also reviewed by the President of the PTS for *Lingua* 54, 1 (Amsterdam 1981, pp.93-99) to which the reader's attention is directed.

Deutsch-Pāli Wörterbuch. Helmut Klar. Octopus Verlag, Vienna 1982. 364pp.

This German-Pāli dictionary will, of course, be of interest only to those readers who know at least some German. It contains, we are told, 7,400 German words with 14,200 Pāli equivalents. The author claims that as there are English-Pāli dictionaries, it is time there was a German-Pāli one, which can be used for practice translations into Pāli (a possibly old-fashioned, but still useful exercise for those learning any language). He also thinks it could serve as an aid to scholars investigating the sociological and other such material found in, for example, the Jātakas, though I am not quite sure how it is supposed to further this aim. It could, of course, also be of use to those, such as Oriental scholar-bhikkhus, who know Pāli already and are learning German.

Anyway, on reflection I realise that it probably has more uses than at first occurred to me: for instance, as a first brief approximation to a Pāli 'Roget's Thesaurus', as for many entries a number of synonyms are given (e.g.

for Hund 'dog' seven variant forms are shown, and for Hüter 'guardian' five equivalents. In some cases an attempt at differentiation is made, but not in others. This feature, as far as it goes, can be quite useful to the student, and it might inspire somebody to attempt a real thesaurus on a larger scale.

Nouns are entered in the nominative form, not the 'stem-form' as in the PTS Dictionary: thus dharmo not dhamma. For the final nasal (niggahita) I noted with interest that the author's typewriter has the symbol ṃ (really the international phonetic sign for ng as in sing) which Rhys Davids unwisely introduced instead of under- or over-dotted m. It has long seemed to me that the threefold representation of this letter causes quite unnecessary inconvenience as well as disputes. It should suffice to print an ordinary m, the student being simply taught that (as in French) a special nasal pronunciation occurs in syllable-final position: sīlam.

The choice of entries seems to me a little arbitrary, depending no doubt on the particular sources extracted. As the author is in fact a doctor, it may be assumed that the medical terms included are more accurate than in some other dictionaries and translations.

The book is clearly a labour of love, is nicely produced in (for the most part) good clear typescript and very solidly bound, appropriately in yellow. Without checking every entry, I noticed a couple of misprints and other small errors: on p.31 samvannketi should read samvanneti (I have substituted a plain m here for the phonetic symbol mentioned above!), and on p.81 vermanī should of course be veramanī (a word well known from the precepts). On p.82 patīccasamupādo occurs under two different head-words. The second of these, Entstehung, bedingte 'Origination, conditioned', is fine; but the first, Entstehen, abhängig-gleichzeitiges 'Origination, dependent-simultaneous', merely reflects the mistranslation of an earlier German scholar. There might be a case for including the term, but it should then be marked as incorrect. On the same page 82 I was delighted to find the 'Eckhartian' Entwerden ('un-becoming') as a head-word for vibhavo.

Maurice Walshe

Pilgrim Kamanita: A Legendary Romance by Karl Gjellerup, translated by John E. Logie. First edition in Thai and English by the Sathirakoses-Nagapradips Foundation B.E. 2520 (1977). Distributed by Saksit Siam Co.Ltd, 1715 Rama IV Rd, Bangkok 11, Thailand. 508pp. Thai and English on facing pages; 4 plates. Baht 150 (on good paper); Baht 80 (on newsprint)

This is an unusual book with a still more unusual history. The author was Danish and originally published his book in German around the beginning of

this century*. It was then translated and published in English (and I wonder why no Western publisher has thought it worthwhile republishing, now that interest in Buddhism is so much greater?), and sometime after rendered into Thai by the two famous literary figures whose pen-names are now the title of the above Foundation, Phya Anuman Rajadhon and Phra Saraprasert respectively.

After its translation into Thai it proved so very popular that it was eventually adapted for Buddhist sermons which to this day can be bought in Bangkok printed on the traditional palm-leaves. This is high praise indeed for a Western novel on the Buddha's times! It has now, probably for the benefit of Thai students learning English, been presented by the enterprising firm of Saksit Siam, in a bilingual edition. Copies may be obtained from the address above.

First, a few words about production and minor errors. This edition (the cheaper one), probably for students, is printed on a Thai paper resembling newsprint. That means its 500 odd pages are not too bulky but on the other hand the book will not last too long. Then the photographic reproduction of the English translation page by page with the Thai, though useful for learning languages, could have been done better. The covers are attractive Indian-style drawings while the text is graced with four drawings by the well-known Thai artist, Angkarn Kalayanapong. It is surprising in view of the novel's age that there are not more errors in the Buddhist parts of the book. Actually these are very few, notably a rather unclear list of Noble Eightfold Path factors on p.214. Also, on the same page, where the Three Characteristics are listed, Max Müller's translation, "All phenomena are unreal", should read - "All dhammas (events) are not-self" (sabbe dhammā anattā). I noticed also, the word 'walk' (pp.380, 432), perhaps a literal translation from the German, where 'conduct' or 'practice' would have been more appropriate. There is an omission easy to amend, on p.212 of the words "Truth of the End of all Suffering". And from a Vinaya point of view it could be objected that the Buddha stands to address the audience (as on p.386), while, of course, he would have sat crosslegged upon a dais or seat. And on p.384 for 'penury' one should read 'material things'. Apparently a footnote is missing on p.290.

Having noticed these small matters that could easily be corrected, it is time to praise further the very broad Indian knowledge of the author as well as his fine and inspiring style. I do not know if the author had ever been to India, but certainly he impresses us with a fascinating picture of high life in ancient times there. And his picture is very convincing in its wealth of detail. Even his flights of fancy like the fiendishly clever robber priest, Vajrasravas and his Kālī Sūtras, are vivid and like enough to be true.

His story is basically of a young merchant's finding of his true love in

a far distant city, and the many difficulties that prevent them from enjoying each other's company thereafter.

All through the long story is woven the figure of Aṅgulimāla, at first shown as a robber much more terrifying than in the suttas, and later a tamed and compassionate bhikkhu. But at the beginning and near to the end the Buddha is depicted in a heart moving way. For sure the author was a true Buddhist.

Though a large part of the book is Kāmanita's account of his life given to the Buddha during the early part of a night, towards the end his beloved, Vāsithī, who has practised far on the path as a bhikkhunī, discourses on her life, her account of the Buddha's Parinibbāna, and from her great wisdom manages to raise up Kāmanita from his attachment to sensuality and sceptical doubt.

I would call the account of Sukhāvātī (not to be confused with Amida's paradise, but more like one of the six sensual-realm heavens), where they are both born in lotuses, quite superb. If words can express heavenly delights then our author has done a very fine job. When it comes to the couple's next rebirth in the Brahma-world, the writing is even more astonishing and I can only admire the author's excellent and convincing imagination. Finally, there is the attempt to convey their 'going-out' or Nibbāna, which is the finest of most evocative pieces of writing - where words cannot really tell.

Then, of course, there is the Dhamma running like a thread all the way through. The author has very skilfully borrowed pieces of suttas and woven them into the right places in his story.

Anyone who enjoys a good tale and loves the Dhamma will like this book. It could be a good introduction to the Buddha's Teachings for some, while for others it will conjure up those fargone days when our Master walked the land of Jambu.

Phra Khantipālo

* First published Frankfurt 1903 and translated into Danish (1906), English (London 1911 and New York 1912), Magyar (Budapest 1922) and Polish. (Editor).

~~~~~

## A BUDDHIST'S MANUAL

by Ven. Dr. H. Saddhātissa & Russell Webb

REVISED EDITION 1982

This indispensable handbook contains material not easily accessible elsewhere in such a compact collection, with many specially prepared English translations.

CONTENTS include, in Pali and English, *Devotional Stanzas, Suttas for Daily Recitation* (viz. Maṅgala, Ratana, Metta Suttas, Mahājayamaṅgala and Jayamaṅgala Gāthā), *Personal* (i.e. marriage and funeral) *Ceremonies in Buddhism, The Buddhist Calendar, Principal Centres in Asia and the West, Buddhist Journals*, and a detailed *Bibliography* of easily obtainable books in print.

NOW AVAILABLE - price £2.00 (including postage) - from :

BRITISH MAHABODHI SOCIETY

5 Heathfield Gardens

LONDON W4 4JU

## Deutsch - Pali Wörterbuch

Helmut Klar

Octopus Verlag, Wien 1982

364 Seiten, gebunden DM 50,- Ö.S. 350

Pali gehört keineswegs in die Gruppe der sogenannten „toten“ Sprachen, sondern dient auch heute noch der Verständigung zwischen gelehrten buddhistischen Mönchen in Sri Lanka, Thailand und anderen Ländern Südostasiens. Innerhalb dieses buddhistischen Kulturkreises hat Pali auf religiös-philosophischem Gebiet fast den Charakter einer internationalen Gelehrtensprache angenommen. — Für Buddhisten aus dem deutschen Sprachraum ist Pali vor allem deshalb so wichtig, weil in dieser Sprache die Lehrreden des Buddha überliefert worden sind. Über die philosophisch-religiösen Texte hinaus bietet die Pali-Literatur aber auch eine Fülle von kulturgeschichtlichem und soziologischem Material, das noch nicht voll ausgewertet worden ist. Neue Forschungen, die ohne Pali-Kenntnisse nicht möglich sind, erschließen weitere Zusammenhänge. Hieraus wird ersichtlich, daß Pali über die rein buddhistischen Aspekte hinaus auch heute noch aktuelle Bedeutung hat, in Südostasien ebenso wie in der westlichen Welt, wo ein Teil dieser Forschungsarbeit geleistet wird.

Anschrift des Verlages: Am Fleischmarkt 16, A 1010 Wien



# WASHINGTON BUDDHIST VIHĀRA

5017 - 16TH STREET, N.W. • WASHINGTON, D.C. 20011 U.S.A.

TELEPHONE: (202) 723-0773

## A SELF-STUDY COURSE ON BUDDHISM

The Washington Buddhist Vihara has issued a course on Buddhism for home-study. The course, called "The Buddha's Teaching As It Is," contains ten 90-minute cassettes on the basic principles of Buddhism. The lectures were composed and recorded by Bhikkhu Bodhi, an American Buddhist monk. Included in the course is a set of notes and glossary for each lecture, a textbook (What the Buddha Taught by Walpola Rahula), and a list of recommended readings for further study. The course comes in a beautiful three-ring gold binder which is compact and easy to carry about. The price for the whole course -- ten cassettes, the textbook, notes, and binder -- is only \$29.95, inclusive of postage and handling.\* To order simply send check or money order with a note to: Vihara Book Service, 5017 - 16th Street N.W., Washington, D.C. 20011. Further information available on request.

\* Foreign orders add \$6 to cover insured surface mailing; payment in international money order, U.S. currency only.  
For further information please write to the Vihara at the above address. Thank you for your cooperation.